REVIEW

Medicina Internacia Revuo, 31(123), 2024

Peering through the smoke: tobacco and smoking representation in Marvel and DC Noir comic books/ graphic novels

Daisy Houghton[1], Frank Houghton[2]

1 University of Limerick, School of English, Irish, and Communication, Limerick, Ireland
2 Technological University of the Shannon, Social Sciences ConneXions Research Institute, Limerick, Ireland
* corresponding author: Frank.Houghton@TUS.ie

RECEIVED: July 7, 2024 ▪ **REVISED:** September 4, 2024 ▪ **ACCEPTED:** September 17, 2024 ▪ **PUBLISHED ONLINE:** Feburary 1, 2025

KEYWORDS: smoking, tobacco graphic novels, comic books, noir, DC, Marvel

Tobacco remains a leading cause of global mortality and morbidity. Although the WHO Framework Convention on Tobacco Control (FCTC) has helped to curtail advertising in many countries, the portrayal of smoking in the media is still a concern. Previous research has highlighted high levels of smoking depictions in noir comic books/ graphic novels. This research sought to explore the level of smoking portrayals in noir comic books/ graphic novels from the world's two largest publishers of such texts, Marvel and DC. This research also sought to explore differences in the rate of smoking portrayals between these publishers given that the Editor-In-Chief of Marvel has openly stated he was largely ending smoking portrayals in Marvel comic books/ graphic novels. Analysis revealed that Marvel noir comic books/ graphic novels featured few images of smoking compared to noir DC publications. This difference was statistically significant. This research suggests that key stakeholders can be highly influential in tobacco control. It also suggests that Public Health and Tobacco Control advocates should seek out and try to work proactively with the media.

INTRODUCTION

Tobacco use remains the leading cause of preventable morbidity and mortality globally, responsible for over 8 million deaths per annum [1-3]. The WHO has led the international response to this problem in the form of the Framework Convention on Tobacco Control (FCTC) [4]. Article 13 of the FCTC specifically addresses tobacco advertising, promotion, and sponsorship [4].

However, although overt tobacco advertising is now restricted in many countries, tobacco continues to feature in many forms of media, even if not in the form of advertising. The prevalence of tobacco advertising in various forms of media and its impact on increasing youth smoking has long been a concern of tobacco control advocates [5-16]. These concerns have included a focus on both magazines [5-9], and links between Hollywood and the tobacco industry [10,11,16]. A particular focus of concern has been on the portrayal of smoking in youth-oriented Superhero movies. The most blatant example is probably Superman II, released in 1981, which featured Superman's attractive love interest as a smoker [16,17]. This movie featured extensive product placement for Marlboro [16,17]. Numerous superheroes and villains have routinely

been depicted as smokers in comics for decades [18].

However, the use of superhero characters to promote or depict smoking is not universal. In 1980 the UK's Health Education Council launched a multi-media initiative based on the character Superman combatting a new villain 'Nick O'Teen' who attempted to lure children into smoking [19]. The advertising company Saatchi & Saatchi was hired to support this initiative which involved a range of materials, including TV advertisements, posters, badges, and comic books (see Figure 1).

FIGURE 1. Saatchi & Saatchi's depiction of Superman as an Anti-Tobacco Activist [19]

It is important to note that graphic novel reading is no longer confined to an adolescent and male demographic and has expanded in recent years [20-24]. The use of comic books/ graphic novels to address health issues has also become commonplace. Such comic books/ graphic novels address a wide number of health issues ranging from healthy diets to HIV to cancer [25-37]. A notable use of graphic novels to promote health may be seen in the CDC's use of an imagined zombie pandemic outbreak to promote emergency preparedness among young adults [38]. However, evidence suggests that this innovative initiative, although very popular, did little to promote preparedness, and may have led to a focus on firearms and weapons [39-44].

Therefore, as well as serving to combat stigma, promote health, and raise awareness, comic books can also depict, and potentially reinforce and promote health-damaging behaviours [45,46]. One avenue in which this has been researched is in relation to smoking. Examinations of the issue of smoking portrayals in graphic novels began with an examination of Japanese Manga novels [47-49]. More recent examinations of graphic novels have noted problematic levels of smoking in cyber-punk and noir novels [50]. Noir novels are routinely based on the sleazy and squalid underbelly of American society of the late 1920s to 1950s as typically featured in the works of writers such as Hammett [51-54], Caine [55-57] and Chandler [58-62]. There has been a resurgence in the noir style in the media in recent years [63-67]. Follow-up research specifically explored smoking portrayals in the noir genre of graphic novels [68], and in texts associated with drawing in the noir comic book style [69]. As well as noting high levels of smoking portrayals in the noir graphic novel style, this research also reported higher levels of male portrayals of smoking, as well as links between smoking and machismo and smoking and sexuality [68,69]. Alarmingly, explicit and specifically pro-smoking anti-health messaging was also noted [69].

Many comic books and graphic novels were at least nominally under the oversight of the Comics Code and the Cigarette Advertising Code. However, ample evidence suggests that these were ineffec-

tive in preventing portrayals of advertising in comic books [17,70-73]. Although industry-wide self-regulation may often be ineffective [74] , key stakeholders can potentially influence issues [70-73]. Research on noir-themed comic books has highlighted the importance of working with industry to reduce portrayals of smoking [69]. Groth has noted how pivotal figures in the legislature and in the comic book industry opposed smoking portrayals in comic books (17,70-73). Of particular note is the impact of the Editor-in-Chief of Marvel comics Joe Quesada. Quesada effectively banned depictions of smoking in the heroes and heroines of Marvel publications in 2001, although villains could continue to be portrayed as smokers [71].

As noted above, there is a high level of tobacco portrayals evident in noir comic books/ graphic novels [50,68] and associated materials [69]. In light of the anti-smoking influence of one key stakeholder, Quesada, this research sought to explore if there was a difference between portrayals of smoking in DC versus Marvel comic books/ graphic novels. These two publishers dominate the comic book/ graphic novel market, accounting for over 75% of sales [17].

METHOD

The researchers searched online for titles of noir comic books/ graphic novels published by either Marvel Comics or DC. Sites searched included the DC and Marvel company websites, Amazon, and Google. Identified comic books/ graphic novels were then examined for portrayals of smoking as part of a quantitative content analysis [75-77]. Images were reviewed by both researchers and discussed where uncertainty existed. Most pages of a comic book/ graphic novel contain numerous individual panels. These were examined and coded by whether each panel featured any of the following: one or more male smokers; one or more female smokers; male and female smokers; other smokers (e.g. Alien/ Robot); or negative portrayals of smoking. A total of 22 noir-themed DC and Marvel comic books/ graphic novels were identified [78-99].

RESULTS

Table 1 details the findings of the smoking content analysis in the 11 DC comic books/ graphic novels identified [78- 88]. The number of panels identified featuring smoking is in DC publications is substantial, ranging from 10 in Batman Noir: The Black Mirror [83] to 198 in Watchmen Noir [78] (Mean= 42.4, SD= 53.2).

TABLE 1. Smoking Portrayals in Panels in DC Comic Books/ Graphic Novels

TITLE	MALE	FEMALE	BOTH	OTHER	NEGATIVE	TOTAL
Watchmen Noir [78]	160	33	5	0	0	198
Batman Noir: Eduardo Risso Deluxe Edition [79]	32	10	0	0	0	42
Batman Noir: The Killing Joke [80]	14	0	0	0	0	14
Madame Xanadu: Exodus Noir [81]	26	6	1	0	0	33
Batman Noir: The Dark Knight Returns [82]	50	0	0	5	0	55
Batman Noir: The Black Mirror [83]	10	0	0	0	0	10
Batman Noir: The Court of Owls [84]	16	0	0	0	0	16
Batman Noir: Dark Victory [85]	24	0	0	0	1	25
Batman Noir: Gotham by Gaslight [86]	29	0	0	0	0	29
Batman Noir: The Dark Knight Strikes Again [87]	25	0	0	0	0	25
Batman: Gotham Noir [88]	10	9	0	0	0	19

TABLE 2. Smoking Portrayals in Panels in Marvel Comic Books/ Graphic Novels

TITLE	MALE	FEMALE	BOTH	OTHER	NEGATIVE	TOTAL
Weapon X Noir [89]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Wolverine Noir (I-IV Volumes) [90]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Luke Cage Noir (I-IV Volumes) [91]	9	0	0	0	0	9
Punisher Noir [92]	2	1	0	0	0	2
Spider-Man Noir: Volume I [93]	2	0	0	0	0	2
Spider-Man Noir: Volume II [94]	0	0	0	0	0	0
Spider-Man Noir: Eyes Without A Face [95]	1	0	0	0	0	1
Iron Man Noir [96]	0	0	0	0	0	0
X-Men Noir: Mark of Cain [97]	0	0	0	0	0	0
X-Men Noir [98]	1	0	0	0	0	1

Table 2 details the findings in the 11 Marvel comic books/ graphic novels identified [89-99]. The number of panels identified featuring smoking in Marvel publications is relatively low, ranging from 0 across a range of sources [89-90,93,95-96] to 12 in the 4-volume Daredevil Noir (Mean= 2.5, SD= 4.1). Overall, men are far more likely than women to be portrayed as smokers.

As the data was highly skewed non-parametric analysis was conducted to explore differences by Publishing Company (i.e. Marvel or DC), and in terms of gender. A Mann-Whitney U test was performed to compare the number of panels depicting smoking in DC versus Marvel comic books/ graphic novels. There was a significant difference in the number of panels portraying smoking between DC and Marvel comic books/ graphic novels; z = -3.933, p <.001. A Mann-Whitney U test was performed to compare the number of panels depicting smoking by gender in DC and Marvel comic books/ graphic novels. There was a significant difference in the number of panels portraying smoking between males and females in the comic books/ graphic novels; z = -3.234, p =.001. Examples of some of the smoking imagery included in DC comic books/ graphic novels is shown in Figure 2.

DISCUSSION

In line with previous research, this examination identified highly problematic levels of portrayals of smoking in DC noir comic books/ graphic novels [50,68-69]. Such imagery was typically associated with male characters, which once again replicates prior findings [50,68]. Given the popularity of graphic novels, this finding is a cause for concern. Such media may not only reflect smoking culture but may also serve to reinforce and reproduce smoking. This issue is important as although these texts are increasingly read by older age groups, and women as well as men, their predominant reader-

FIGURE 2. Examples of Smoking Imagery in DC's Noir Comic Books/ Graphic Novels

ship remains young males. However, an important finding in this research was the significantly lower levels of smoking portrayals in Marvel comic books/ graphic novels. As noted above much of this difference may be the result of a firm stance taken by the Marvel Editor-In-Chief [71]. This finding suggests that Public Health and Tobacco-Control advocates should seek to identify and work with industry stakeholders that may be open to health messaging. In the meantime, comic books/ graphic novels should be required to carry an age rating that reflects not only complexity/ reading age, level of violence, and sexual explicitness, but also portrayals of issues such as smoking and alcohol and illicit drug use.

Resumo

Tabako restas ĉefa kaŭzo de tutmonda morteco kaj malsaneco. Kvankam la Kadra Konvencio de la OMS pri Tabakkontrolo (FCTC) helpis limigi reklamadon en multaj landoj, la portretado de fumado en la amaskomunikilaro daŭre maltrankviligas. Antaŭa esplorado elstarigis altajn nivelojn de fumbildigoj en noiraj komiksoj/grafikaj romanoj. Ĉi tiu esplorado serĉis esplori la nivelon de fumaj portretadoj en noiraj komiksoj/grafikaj romanoj de la du plej grandaj eldonejoj de tiaj tekstoj de la mondo, Marvel kaj DC. Ĉi tiu esplorado ankaŭ serĉis esplori diferencojn en la indico de fumaj portretadoj inter ĉi tiuj eldonistoj pro tio, ke la Ĉefredaktisto de Marvel malkaŝe deklaris, ke li plejparte finas fumajn portretojn en komiksoj/grafikaj romanoj de Marvel. Analizo rivelis ke Marvel noir komiksoj/grafikaj romanoj havis malmultajn bildojn de fumado komparite kun DC-publikaĵoj. Ĉi tiu diferenco estis statistike signifa. Ĉi tiu esplorado sugestas, ke esencaj koncernatoj povas esti tre influaj en tabaka kontrolo. Ĝi ankaŭ sugestas, ke defendantoj pri Publika Sano kaj Tabakkontrolo devus serĉi kaj provi labori proaktive kun la amaskomunikilaro.

Conflict of Interest

The authors of this article declare that there is no conflict of interest.

Funding

The authors received no financial support for the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.

References

1. GBD 2015 Tobacco Collaborators et al. Smoking prevalence and attributable disease burden in 195 countries and territories, 1990-2015: a systematic analysis from the Global Burden of Disease Study 2015. Lancet. 2017; 389(10082): 1885-1906.
2. GBD 2019 Tobacco Collaborators (2021). Spatial, temporal, and demographic patterns in prevalence of smoking tobacco use and attributable disease burden in 204 countries and territories, 1990-2019: a systematic analysis from the Global Burden of Disease Study 2019. Lancet. 397(10292): 2337–2360.
3. WHO. Tobacco Key Facts. 2023. https://www.who.int/news-room/fact-sheets/detail/tobacco#:~:text=Tobacco%20kills%20more%20than%208,%2D%20and%20middle%2Dincome%20countries.
4. WHO. WHO Framework Convention on Tobacco Control (FCTC). https://fctc.who.int/
5. King C, Siegel M. The Master Settlement Agreement with the tobacco industry and cigarette advertising in magazines. N Engl J Med. 2001; 345(7):504–511. doi: 10.1056/nejmsa003149.
6. Hamilton WL, Turner-Bowker DM, Celebucki CC, Connolly GN. Cigarette advertising in magazines: the tobacco industry response to the Master Settlement Agreement and to public pressure. Tob Control. 2002; 11(suppl 2): ii54–ii58. doi: 10.1136/tc.11.suppl_2.ii54.
7. Krupka LR, Vener AM, Richmond G. Tobacco advertising in gender-oriented popular magazines. Journal of Drug Education. 1990; 20(1): 15–29.. doi: 10.2190/6bww-rg2b-cv80-xyxn.
8. Pucci LG, Siegel M. Exposure to brand-specific cigarette advertising in magazines and its impact on youth smoking. Prev Med. 1999; 29(5): 313–320. doi: 10.1006/pmed.1999.0554.
9. Kasujee N, Britton J, Cranwell J, Lyons A, Bains M. Portrayal of tobacco smoking in popular women's magazines: a content analysis. J Public Health. 2017; 39(3): 427–428.. doi: 10.1093/pubmed/fdw104.
10. Lum KL, Polansky JR, Jackler RK, Glantz SA. Signed, sealed and delivered: “big tobacco” in Hollywood, 1927–1951. Tob Control. 2008;17(5): 313–323.
11. Tickle JJ, Sargent JD, Dalton MA, Beach ML, Heatherton TF. Favourite movie stars, their tobacco use in contemporary movies, and its association with adolescent smoking. Tob Control. 2001; 10(1): 16–22.
12. Chapman S, Davis RM. Smoking in movies: is it a

problem? Tob Control. 1997; 6(4): 269–271. doi: 10.1136/tc.6.4.269.
13. Sargent JD. Smoking in movies: impact on adolescent smoking. Adolesc Med Clin. 2005; 16(2): 345–370. doi: 10.1016/j.admecli.2005.02.003.
14. Sargent JD, Hanewinkel R. Impact of media, movies and TV on tobacco use in the youth. In R. Loddenkemper & M. Kreuter (Eds.) The Tobacco Epidemic, pp. 171-180. Basel, Switzerland: Karger; 2015.
15. Charlesworth A, Glantz SA. Smoking in the movies increases adolescent smoking: a review. Pediatrics. 2005; 116(6): 1516–1528.
16. Magnus P. Superman and the Malboro woman. The lungs of Lois Lane. New York State Journal of Medicine. 1985; 85(7): 342–343.
17. Groth JM. The Cigarette, The Batman, and The Youth: a History of Tobacco Regulations and Comic Books – Part I: Introduction. ComicCritter. 2015; July. https://comiccritter.wordpress.com/2015/07/11/introduction-to-the-cigarette-the-batman-and-the-youth-a-history-of-tobacco-regulations-and-comic-books-blog-series/
18. Comic Vine. Got a light? https://comicvine.gamespot.com/profile/eganthevile1/lists/got-a-light/13587/
19. Mold, A., Elizabeth, H. Superman vs. Nick O'Teen: anti-smoking campaigns and children in 1980s Britain. Palgrave Commun. 2019; 5: 116. https://doi.org/10.1057/s41599-019-0326-6
20. Stewart R. Graphic reading. The Bookseller. 2003; October. https://www.thebookseller.com/feature/graphic-reading. .
21. Le Duc D. Twenty First Century Graphic Novels. Belphegor. 2005; 5(1): 1–8.
22. HHH.Evans C, Gaudet F. Comic Strip Readership. Culture études. 2012; 2(2): 1–8. doi: 10.3917/cule.122.0001.
23. Nyberg AK. Graphic Novels and Comics in Libraries and Archives: Essays on Readers, Research, History and Cataloguing. South Orange, NJ: Seton Hall University; 2010. How Librarians Learned to Love the Graphic Novel.
24. Strong Hansen K. In Defense of Graphic Novels. The English Journal. 2012; 102(2): 57–63.
25. Leung MM, Green MC, Tate DF, Cai J, Wyka K, Ammerman AS. Fight for Your Right to Fruit: Psychosocial Outcomes of a Manga Comic Promoting Fruit Consumption in Middle-School Youth. Health Communication. 2017; 32(5): 533-540.
26. Leung MM, Tripicchio G, Agaronov A, Hou N. Manga comic influences snack selection in Black and Hispanic New York City youth. Journal of Nutrition Education and Behavour. 2014; 46(2): 142-7.
27. Shimazaki T, Matsushita M, Iio M, Takenaka K. Use of health promotion manga to encourage physical activity and healthy eating in Japanese patients with metabolic syndrome: a case study. Archives of Public Health. 2018; 76(1): 26.
28. Wang JL, Acevedo N, Sadler GR. Using Comics to Promote Colorectal Cancer Screening in the Asian American and Pacific Islander Communities. Journal of Cancer Education. 2018; 33(6): 1263–1269.
29. Willis LA, Kachur R, Castellanos TJ, et al. Developing a Motion Comic for HIV/STD Prevention for Young People Ages 15-24, Part 1: Listening to Your Target Audience. Health Communication. 2018; 33(2): 212–221.
30. Willis LA, Kachur R, Castellanos TJ, et al. Developing a Motion Comic for HIV/STD Prevention for Young People Ages 15-24, Part 2: Evaluation of a Pilot Intervention, Health Communication. 2018; 33(3): 229–237.
31. Czerwiec MK, Huang MN. Hospice Comics: Representations of Patient and Family Experience of Illness and Death in Graphic Novels. Journal of Medical Humanities. 2017; 38(2): 95–113.
32. Wood A. Drawing disability in Japanese manga: visual politics, embodied masculinity, and wheelchair basketball in Inoue Takehiko's REAL. Culture, Medicine, and Psychiatry. 2013; 37(4): 638-55.
33. Sutherland T, Choi D, Yu C. "Brought to life through imagery" - animated graphic novels to promote empathic, patient-centred care in postgraduate medical learners. BMC Medical Education. 2021; 21(1): 66.
34. Babaian CS, Chalian AA. "The thyroidectomy story": comic books, graphic novels, and the novel approach to teaching head and neck surgery through the genre of the comic book. Journal of Surgical Education. 2014; 71(3): 413–418.
35. Montgomery M, Manuelito B, Nass C, Chock T, Buchwald D. The Native Comic Book Project: native youth making comics and healthy decisions. Journal of Cancer Education: The Official Journal of the American Association for Cancer Education. 2012; 27(1 Suppl): S41–S46.
36. Imamura K, Kawakami N, Furukawa TA, Matsuyama Y. Shimazu A, Umanodan R, Kawakami S, Kasai K. Effects of an Internet-based cognitive behavioral therapy (iCBT) program in Manga format on improving subthreshold depressive symptoms among healthy workers: a randomized controlled trial. PLoS One. 2014; 9(5): e97167.
37. Ma C, Green C, Zhao J, Egli V, Clark T, Donnellan N, Smith M. Creative and visual communication of health research: development of a graphic novel to share children's neighbourhood perspectives of COVID-19 lockdowns in Aotearoa New Zealand.

Visual Communication. 2023; 0(0). https://doi.org/10.1177/14703572231157042
38. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. (2015). Zombie preparedness. Retrieved on 03/01/2023 from: https://stacks.cdc.gov/view/cdc/6023
39. Houghton F, Del Monte K, Glessner D, Goff J, Hopkins E, Loney K, Meratnia G, Toms J. Zombie Pandemic Preparedness: a Cautionary Observation. New Zealand Medical Journal. 2016; 129: 1432.
40. Fraustino JD, Ma L. CDC's use of social media and humor in a risk campaign—"Preparedness 101: Zombie Apocalypse". Journal of Applied Communication Research. 2015; 43: 222-241.
41. Kruvand M, Bryant FB. Zombie apocalypse: Can the undead teach the living how to survive an emergency? Public Health Reports. 2015; 130: 655-663.
42. Houghton F, Hopkins E, Loney K, Luther L, Norris A, Toms J. Examination of the impact of using a zombie pandemic scenario to encourage emergency preparedness among elementary school children: the weapons issue. Washington State Journal of Public Health Practice. 2016; 9.
43. Houghton F, Toms J, Meratnia G, Loney K, Hopkins E, Del Monte K. Concerns with entertainment-education: Zombie pandemic preparedness and the unanticipated promotion of a weapons culture. Health Education & Behavior. 2016; 1-5.
44. Houghton F, Hopkins E. Zombies and weapons: examining blog responses to the Centers for Disease Control & Prevention's (CDC) 'Preparedness 101: Zombie pandemic' entertainment-education initiative. Medicina Internacia Revuo. 2023; 30(121): 249-259.
45. Coyne SM, Callister M, Stockdale L, Coutts H, Collier KM. "Just how graphic are graphic novels?" An examination of aggression portrayals in manga and associations with aggressive behavior in adolescents. Violence Vict. 2015; 30(2): 208–224. doi: 10.1891/0886-6708.vv-d-13-00012.
46. Seko Y, Kikuchi M. Self-Injury in Japanese Manga: A Content Analysis. J Med Humanit. 2020. doi: 10.1007/s10912-019-09602-9.
47. Nakahara S, Ichikawa M, Wakai S. Smoking scenes in Japanese comics: a preliminary study. Tobacco Control. 2005; 14: 71.
48. Jimbo M. Japanese Manga and Smoking: Puffing Away. International Institute Journal. 2012; 2: 1.
49. Lee YH, DeJong J. Depictions of Tobacco and Alcohol Use in Contemporary Japanese Shōnen Manga: A Content Analysis. Journal of Health Communication. 2019; 24(11): 848-855.
50. Houghton D, Houghton F. An Examination of Portrayals of Smoking in Graphic Novels/ Comic Books: A picture is worth a thousand words. Tobacco Prevention & Cessation. 2020; 6: 41.
51. Hammett DS. Red Harvest. New York: Alfred A. Knopf, Inc.; 1929.
52. Hammett, DS. The Dain Curse. New York: Alfred A. Knopf, Inc.; 1929
53. Hammett DS. The Maltese Falcon. New York: Alfred A. Knopf, Inc.; 1930
54. Hammett DS. The Thin Man. New York: Alfred A. Knopf, Inc.; 1934.
55. Cain JM. The Postman Always Rings Twice. New York: Alfred A. Knopf, Inc.; 1934.
56. Cain JM. Double Indemnity. New York: Alfred A. Knopf, Inc.; 1936.
57. Cain JM. Mildred Pierce. New York: Alfred A. Knopf, Inc.; 1941.
58. Chandler R. The Big Sleep. New York: Alfred A. Knopf, Inc.; 1939.
59. Chandler R. Farewell, My Lovely. New York: Alfred A. Knopf, Inc.; 1940.
60. Chandler R. The High Window. New York: Alfred A. Knopf, Inc.; 1942.
61. Chandler R. The Lady in The Lake. New York: Alfred A. Knopf, Inc.; 1943.
62. Chandler R. The Long Goodbye. Bloomsbury, London: Hamish Hamilton; 1953.
63. Bukoski A. The Noir Thriller, Studies in the Novel. 2002; 34(4): 468-470.
64. Wandtke T. The Dark Night Returns: The Contemporary Resurgence of Crime Comics. Rochester, New York: Rit Press; 2015.
65. Spicer A, Hanson H. (eds) A Companion to Film Noir. Hoboken, NJ: Blackwell Publishing Ltd.; 2013.
66. Bould M. Film Noir: From Berlin to Sin City. New York: Wallflower Press, Columbia University Press; 2005.
67. Tilley CL. The dark night returns: the contemporary resurgence of crime comics. Consumption Markets & Culture. 2016; 19(6): 603-606.
68. Houghton D, Houghton F. An Examination of Portrayals of Smoking in Noir/Comic Novels. Medicina Internacia Revuo. 2022; 30(119): 107-118.
69. Houghton D, Houghton F. Drawing it properly: An examination of smoking portrayals in texts on how to draw in the noir graphic novel/ comic book style. Medicina Internacia Revuo. 2022; 30(120): 194-209.
70. Groth JM. The Cigarette, The Batman, and The Youth: a History of Tobacco Regulations and Comic Books – Part II: The Codes. ComicCritter. 2015; July. https://comiccritter.wordpress.com/2015/07/17/the-cigarette-the-batman-and-the-youth-a-history-of-tobacco-regulations-and-comic-books-part-ii-the-codes/

71. Groth JM. The Cigarette, The Batman, and The Youth: a History of Tobacco Regulations and Comic Books – Part III: Smoking Depiction Regulations and Anti-Smoking Messages. ComicCritter. 2015; August. https://comiccritter.wordpress.com/2015/08/23/the-cigarette-the-batman-and-the-youth-a-history-of-tobacco-regulations-and-comic-books-part-iii-smoking-depiction-regulations/
72. Groth JM. The Cigarette, The Batman, and The Youth: a History of Tobacco Regulations and Comic Books – Part IV: Smoking Depictions and the First Amendment. ComicCritter. 2015; November. https://comiccritter.wordpress.com/2015/11/22/part-iv-smoking-depictions-and-the-first-amendment/
73. Groth JM. The Cigarette, The Batman, and The Youth: a History of Tobacco Regulations and Comic Books – Part V: Advocating for Industry Self-Regulation. ComicCritter. 2016; July. https://comiccritter.wordpress.com/2016/07/10/part-v-advocating-for-industry-self-regulation/
74. Saloojee Y, Dagli E. Tobacco industry tactics for resisting public policy on health. Bulletin of the World Health Organization. 2000; 78(7): 902–910.
75. Rose S, Spinks N, Canhoto AI. Management Research: Applying the Principles London: Routledge; 2015.
76. Domas White M, Marsh EE. Content Analysis: A Flexible Methodology. Library Trends. 2006; 55(1): 23.
77. Krippendorff K. Content Analysis: An Introduction to Its Methodology. California: Sage; 2013.
78. Moore A, Gibbons D. Watchmen Noir. Burbank, California: DC; 2016.
79. Azzarello B, Risso E. Batman Noir: Eduardo Risso Deluxe Edition. Burbank, California: DC; 2013.
80. Moore A, Bolland B. Batman Noir: The Killing Joke. Burbank, California: DC; 2016.
81. Wagner M, Kaluta M. Madame Xanadu: Exodus Noir. Burbank, California: Vertigo (DC); 2010.
82. Miller F, Janson K. Batman Noir: The Dark Knight Returns. Burbank, California: DC; 2015.
83. Snyder S. Francavilla F. Batman Noir: The Black Mirror. Burbank, California: DC; 2016.
84. Snyder S, Capullo G. Batman Noir: The Court of Owls. Burbank, California: DC; 2017.
85. Loeb J, Sale T. Batman Noir: Dark Victory. Burbank, California: DC; 2017.
86. Augustyn B, Mignola M. Batman Noir: Gotham by Gaslight. Burbank, California: DC; 2019.
87. Miller F. Batman Noir: The Dark Knight Strikes Again. Burbank, California: DC; 2018.
88. Brubaker E, Phillips S, Stewart D. Batman: Gotham Noir. Burbank, California: DC; 2001.
89. Calero D, Smith CP. Weapon X Noir. New York: Marvel; 2010.
90. Moore S, Smith CP. Wolverine Noir (I-IV Volumes). New York: Marvel; 2022.
91. Glass A, Benson M, Martinbrough S. Luke Cage Noir (I-IV Volumes). New York: Marvel; 2009.
92. Tieri F, Azaceta P, Fuso A. Punisher Noir. New York: Marvel; 2010.
93. Hine D, Sapolsky F, De Giandomenico C. Spider-Man Noir: Volume I. New York: Marvel; 2008.
94. Stohl M, Ferreyra J. Spider-Man Noir: Volume II. New York: Marvel; 2020.
95. Hine D, Sapolsky F. Spider-Man Noir: Eyes Without A Face. New York: Marvel; 2010.
96. Snyder S. Iron Man Noir . New York: Marvel; 2010.
97. Van Lente F, Calero D. X-Men Noir: Mark of Cain. New York: Marvel; 2009
98. Van Lente F, Calero D. X-Men Noir. New York: Marvel; 2009.
99. Irvine A, Coker T. Daredevil Noir (I-IV Volumes). New York: Marvel; 2022.